

author is not afraid to tackle Thomas Innes himself on this point and for his neglect of the college on behalf of his historical studies. Misunderstandings between bishops and staff, or between Rome and staff, are explored, yet without enough heed paid to the subject's complexity. One notes the absence in the bibliography of many of the recent studies on Jansenism. One can also agree that Alexander Geddes was not a typical Scots cleric, while wishing to assert his important advances in biblical criticism. It is a pity, moreover, that the author has not examined the library of Alexander Gordon (died 1724), which might have illuminated Gordon's general position.

In the account of the college archives, the early period deserves more attention. Besides what Beaton brought (and later augmented) in 1560 from Glasgow (and he had to leave much behind), there are the forty or so Beaton-owned books donated to Glasgow University by his Protestant successor, James Boyd; the Henry Sinclair collection which included the council material published in translation by the Scottish History Society; the Hamilton "recueil"; and some at least of Giovanni Ferrerio's letters to Scotland. It was probably at the Paris college that notes on Scottish saints by John Hunter, exiled last prior of the Glasgow Dominicans, were deposited, used as they were by David Chalmers in his book; and much else.

There are some odd misspellings: expatriots, Barbarino, Bishop Jean Soannes (for Soannen) of Senez, Mongerons for Montgéron. According to the "blue Nuns", Principal Alexander Gordon was actually Peter Alexander Gordon. All in all, it is good to have a full history of the college and to find a busy parish priest finding time to attack this subject and to throw considerable light on it.

John Durkan
University of Glasgow

Glasgow's Gaelic Churches: Religion in an Urban Setting 1690-1995. By Ian R. MacDonald. Edinburgh: The Knox Press, 1995. £4.50. ISBN 0 904422 66 6.

In the late medieval town of Glasgow, the Gaelic speaker from the none-too-distant Highland hinterland would have been a familiar figure, but it is only in the late 17th century that a recognisable, self-

conscious Gaelic community within Glasgow can be detected. With the growth of the industrial town in the 18th century, and its rapid expansion in the 19th, concurrent with social and economic upheaval in the Highlands, that community substantially increased in size, it being estimated that by the mid-19th century Glasgow had some 45,000 Gaelic speakers among its citizens.

One important indicator of that community's growth and vigour is the provision made within the city for religious ordinances in the Gaelic language and the building of separate Gaelic churches, beginning with the Ingram Street Gaelic Chapel of 1770, still precariously alive, on its third site, as St Columba Gaelic Church of Scotland. Dr MacDonald's useful and illuminating survey, drawing mainly on presbytery and kirk session records and a wide range of published memoirs of the 19th century, examines these beginnings and the varied later developments of the 19th and 20th centuries. He divides his treatment into seven short chapters: Glasgow's Highlanders and the Church's Mission; Gaelic Churches prior to 1843; the post-Disruption history of pre-Disruption Gaelic congregations; post-1900 Churches with Gaelic Ministry; the Ebb-tide; the Things that Remain and are Ready to Die. Within that framework, we are given glimpses of a fascinating range of characters, ministerial and other, who were involved in the establishing and maintaining of Glasgow's Highland churches. The upheavals of the Disruption of 1843, the Free Presbyterian Secession of 1893, and the unions of 1900 and 1929, all had their own seismic effects, and in addition to that the movement was prone to divisiveness and fractious personal relations. Dr MacDonald makes the important point that the early presbyterian "chapels" were established mainly through grassroots initiative, and their non-parochial status coupled with the Gaelic dimension gave them a kind of semi-detachment from church structures which made it easier for them to survive or re-form at times of crisis like the Disruption.

Dr MacDonald's account is most "at home" with the Free Church congregations, both of the 19th century and post-1900. He takes note of Roman Catholic provision in the late 18th and early 19th century, but loses sight of Roman Catholic developments thereafter. His treatment of St Columba Church of Scotland is marred by a curious

lapse from scholarly sobriety where (p. 68) he credits “some church watchers” with the startling observation that “Druidical as well as Christian elements feature in the worship”. The same paragraph includes references to “liturgy”, “High Church tradition” and “Gaelic hymns rather than Psalms”. While St Columba Church has been distinctive in introducing Gaelic hymns (translated from the first edition of *The Church Hymnary*) sung to organ accompaniment, along with (rather than in place of) Psalms, on any recognisable scale of “highness” within Scottish Presbyterianism it would probably rank “low to medium”. Even in terms of architecture, while its Gothic style might suggest links with the Scoto-Catholic movement of the late 19th century, its three galleries betray it as more an auditorium than a place of ritual.

The only architectural feature to figure in Dr MacDonald’s account relates to a mission established by the Free Church in Maitland Street, Cowcaddens, in 1861. The new church included “an external stone pulpit subtended midway up an outside wall with access to it through a door set in the side of the building. From this vantage point it would have been possible to harangue an audience in the street below but apparently this method of open-air preaching was discouraged by the municipal authority possibly as being provocative of Irish-Catholic sensitivities”. (p. 49) This raises the topic of evangelism within the urban context, and Dr MacDonald shows that the attitude of Glasgow’s Gaelic congregations to evangelism of unchurched Highlanders was somewhat ambivalent. There were individuals who were keen to reach out, and others, often church office-bearers, who were more cautious. In one sense the Gaelic churches did not need to evangelise – they could gather substantial congregations from the steady inflow to the city of Highlanders who were for the most part naturally church-going – so that their evangelism was mainly evangelism “within the walls”. There were, however, other evangelistic influences at work. The Moody and Sankey campaigns of the late 19th century and even the Billy Graham crusade of 1955 were not without impact, the former influencing the Glasgow Highland Mission led for many years by Duncan McColl (1846-1930). There were also in the present century the significant

labours of roving evangelists like D.T. MacKay of Tiree and Duncan Campbell of the Faith Mission.

Dr MacDonald's somewhat homiletical concluding retrospect is largely taken up with an explanation of the distinctiveness of Free Church worship which, of course, neither was nor is confined to Glasgow. He appears to conclude that the survival of a Highland tradition within Glasgow's churches is necessarily linked to the Authorised Version of the Bible and the continuing use of the Metrical Psalms. In the longer perspective of church history, it is well to remember that both of these were controversial innovations in their time. What the sadly depleted remnants of Glasgow's Gaelic congregations have perhaps more urgently to consider is how a "ghetto" mindset can be changed, and a relevant Christian witness maintained, when the ghetto walls have crumbled and Glasgow's Highlanders have become much more completely absorbed in their urban and suburban communities. Dr MacDonald's fascinating little volume is a valuable introduction to an important part of the Glasgow Highland experience, and points to numerous avenues for further detailed research.

Kenneth D. MacDonald
University of Glasgow

Her Majesty's Historiographer Gordon Donaldson 1931-1993. A Portrait By James Kirk. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1996. Pp. viii + 291. £25.00. ISBN 0 7073 10726 0.

Dr James Kirk has placed us all in his debt by providing this portrait of one whom he rightly describes as "possibly the most prolific and influential of Scottish historians that the twentieth century has produced". It is a well rounded portrait and not without surprises even for those who thought they knew Professor Donaldson fairly well. Yet this very Edinburgh man actually thought of settling in London and would have done so had he found a job there. It is equally astonishing that the Scottish Record Office failed to appoint him on his first applying for a post as a second class clerk. This omission was made good on the unexpected resignation of Dr Annie Cameron on her marriage in 1938.

